

Designing Online Marketing Communication Programs To Improve Bling It On's Instagram Using Benchmarking Method And Analytical Hierarchy Process (Ahp) Tool

1st Arinda Layla Alfira
Faculty of Industrial Engineering
Telkom University
Bandung, Indonesia
arindalayla@student.telkomuniversity.ac.id

2nd Yati Rohayati
Faculty of Industrial Engineering
Telkom University
Bandung, Indonesia
yatirohayati@telkomuniversity.ac.id

3rd Ima Normalia Kusmayanti
Faculty of Industrial Engineering
Telkom University
Bandung, Indonesia
kusmayanti@telkomuniversity.ac.id

Abstract

Bling It On is a local brand from Bandung that was founded in 2019. **Bling It On** focuses on selling various shoulder bags with unique and attractive models. For the last period, **Bling It On's** income was unstable and did not reach the target, especially in online sales. One of the causes is low brand awareness of **Bling It On** due to less of Instagram optimization as the main platform in the marketing communication program. This research uses a benchmarking method through observations to identify gaps and find best practices from competitors' performance in Instagram. The Analytical Hierarchy Process (AHP) is also used as a decision-making tool to find the priority ranking on criteria (feed, story, profile, caption, reels) and

the 16 Instagram sub criteria that are obtained from integration between VOC and previous research. From the results of this research, **Bling It On** is able to identify their weaknesses and design the appropriate strategies to improve Instagram performance by implementing the importance order of Instagram criteria and sub criteria. To overcome the shortcomings in the research, the researcher arranges implementation plans and work standards from the improvement design that have been validated by the problem owner.

Keywords: Instagram, Online Marketing Communication, Benchmarking, Analytical Hierarchy Process, Fashion Brands

I. INTRODUCTION

Bling It On is a local brand from Bandung that established in June 2019. **Bling It On** focuses on producing shoulder bags with unique bag models such as the design of animal and flowers print patterns. For the last couple of months, **Bling It On** income is unstable and it did not reach the target. To identify the causes of not achieving the revenue target, researcher conduct observations through customer feedback, the results stated that the product and its material has very good quality. It can be stated that **Bling It On** products can be accepted in the market and no need the improvement. Hence, the existence of not achieving sales targets can be caused by several

things that are not maximized by **Bling It On**. So, researcher interviewed with problem owner to identify the root causes of the problems. It shows the root causes are employees with multiple jobs, low brand awareness, and inaccurate market research. These problems probably the factors that cause **Bling It On** income is unstable. So, researcher and the problem owner conduct assessment to determine several alternative solutions to solve those problems. Based on the assessment result, the solution for designing an online marketing communication program on **Bling It On's** social media is chosen because it is

easy, affordable, has a significant impact, and faster to implement than other solution.

A preliminary survey was conducted to find out how well the "Bling It On" brand is recognized by its target market. In conducting the preliminary survey, there were 35 respondents who were women and active Instagram users consisting of students and workers aged between 18 to 30 years with middle to upper-middle class spread across several big cities in Indonesia. According to the preliminary survey, the respondents who know about Bling It On is still quite low, which is only 28.6% or 10 respondents. So, it is proven that Bling It On has not succeeded in doing brand recognition effectively. The low level of Bling It On brand awareness can be influenced by inappropriate social media management.

To prove this, a survey was conducted using a third party, namely the analytical media socialblade.com. Based on the analytical media, it was found that the engagement rate (ER) on Instagram Bling It On is 0.20% with the engagement index is E (very bad). The social media index is also obtained on Instagram Bling It On which has a total grade B-. This shows that Bling It On is still not enough in managing Instagram. Bling It On's marketing communication program is still less effective in attracting new consumers, so it has an impact on low brand awareness.

To find the main cause of the low level of brand awareness and Instagram quality, a further preliminary survey was conducted by doing in-depth interviews with 10 respondents. The purpose of this interview is to find out the weaknesses of performance of Instagram Bling It On. From the interview, less variations of content and less informative caption are needed immediate improvement. Based on the data that has been obtained, it proves that the problem occurs because the use of Instagram Bling It On is not optimal which results in low brand awareness.

Therefore, it is necessary to do research related to marketing communication in order to design improvements for Instagram marketing communication by considering the criteria that must be considered to increase brand awareness and social media engagement for Bling It On. The previous research used Benchmarking to solve this case with the Analytical Hierarchy Process tool [1]

[2]. Hence, researcher can visually see the priority ranking of Instagram and its improvement plans by using this method.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

a. Instagram Criteria and Sub Criteria

Instagram future are considered to be criteria for Instagram marketing communication, and the qualities in the Instagram feature are considered to determine the sub criteria. Therefore, the following are the criteria and sub criteria based on the results of previous research and Voice of Customer (VOC) which can be seen in Table 1.

Table 1 Instagram Criteria and Sub Criteria

Criteria	Sub Criteria
Feed	Display contents that pay attention to visual aesthetics [3]. Uploading various Feed contents [4]. Uploading Feed contents regularly [5]. Uploading contents at the right time (prime time) [6].
Story	Delivering contents that contains a persuasive message (call to action) [7]. Uploading customer feedback [8]. Delivering up-to-date information [9]. Doing endorsements with influencers [10].
Profile	Have a complete profile account [11]. Provide additional reliable information [12]. Has informative Highlights [12].
Caption	Delivering informative captions [13]. Use relevant hashtags on each upload [14]. Having an ideal writing structure [15].
Reels	Uploading interesting video contents [16]. Uploading video contents regularly [17]. Uploading various video contents [16].

III. RESEARCH METHOD

This study aims to obtain a design to improve online marketing communication programs on the Instagram platform. The first step is to get the Voice of Customer (VOC) from in-depth interviews that will be integrated with a literature

study on Instagram features and Instagram marketing success metrics obtained from previous research. The results of this integration are used to determine the Instagram online marketing criteria and sub criteria.

The Analytical Hierarchy Process (AHP) method will be used as a decision-making tool to determine the priority ranking based on the Instagram criteria and sub criteria. The sample size in the questionnaire was determined based on the AHP previously research by using purposive sampling techniques to 30 respondents to obtain more effective and efficient information [18]. The pairwise comparison questionnaire in this research will be carried out on 30 predetermined respondents based on the criteria and target market of Bling It On.

The benchmarking method through observation checklist will also be used to determine the best practices on benchmark partners. The criteria and sub criteria will affect the gap analysis related to the benchmark partner. And then this gap analysis will generate future performance which is used as a consideration in designing improvements to the online marketing communication program on social media Instagram Bling It On.

IV. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

a. Data Processing using AHP (Criteria)

The Instagram criteria comparison matrix is the result of AHP questionnaire recapitulation regarding the comparison of the importance level of each Instagram criterion, including features of Feed, stories, profiles, captions, and reels. The following is the result of questionnaire data processing regarding the importance of Instagram criteria which is shown in Table 2.

Table 2 Priority Vector Recapitulation on Criteria

Criteria	Priority Vector	Ranking	CR (≤ 0.1)
Feed	0.26	2	0.0029
Story	0.28	1	
Profile	0.20	3	
Caption	0.10	5	
Reels	0.16	4	

The results of the processing questionnaire in the table above show the priority vector and Instagram criteria rankings which have the largest value to the smallest value. The comparison of the

importance of Instagram criteria is declared consistent because the CR value $CR \leq 0.1$, so the data processing can be continued to the next stage.

b. Data Processing using AHP (Sub Criteria)

The following are priority vector recapitulation tables which are the result of processing questionnaires on the importance level of each Instagram's sub criteria that consist of Feed, stories, profiles, captions, and reels.

1. Feed

Table 3 Priority Vector on Sub Criteria Feed

Criteria	Priority Vector	Ranking
Feed contents that pay attention to visual aesthetics.	0.25	2
Uploading various Feed contents.	0.28	1
Uploading Feed contents regularly.	0.23	4
Uploading contents at the right time (prime time).	0.24	3

Based on Table 3, uploading various Feed contents regularly must be the main sub criteria that must be prioritized on the Feed criteria in designing marketing communication programs on Bling It On's Instagram.

2. Story

Table 4 Priority Vector on Sub Criteria Story

Criteria	Priority Vector	Ranking
Delivering contents that contains a persuasive message (call to action).	0.17	4
Uploading customer feedback.	0.25	3
Delivering up-to-date information.	0.27	2
Doing endorsements with influencers.	0.31	1

Based on Table 4, endorsement activities using influencers can be utilized through Instagram Stories to increase higher engagement. Because

the delivery of messages through famous figures can affect positive emotions towards the audience, it becomes the main sub criteria that must be prioritized on the story criteria.

3. Profile

Table 5 Priority Vector on Sub Criteria Profile

Criteria	Priority Vector	Ranking
Have a complete profile account	0.28	2
Provide additional reliable information.	0.26	3
Has informative Highlights.	0.46	1

Based on Table 5, the existence of a highlight on the profile that can be used as information storage for customers is the main sub-criteria that is prioritized on the profile criteria.

4. Caption

Table 6 Priority Vector on Sub Criteria Caption

Criteria	Priority Vector	Ranking
Delivering informative captions.	0.43	1
Use relevant hashtags on each upload.	0.17	3
Having an ideal writing structure.	0.41	2

Based on Table 6, writing captions containing information messages on each upload becomes the main sub criteria that must be prioritized on the caption criteria.

5. Reels

Table 7 Priority Vector on Sub Criteria Reels

Criteria	Priority Vector	Ranking
Uploading interesting video contents.	0.52	1
Uploading video contents regularly.	0.11	3
Uploading various video contents.	0.37	2

Based on Table 7, uploading interesting video contents by paying attention to trends and implementing editing features are the main sub

criteria that must be prioritized on the reels criteria.

The following are the results of the consistency ratio (CR) for each Instagram sub criteria:

- Sub criteria on Feed has a CR of 0.065.
- Sub criteria on Story, has a CR of 0.057.
- Sub criteria on Profile, has a CR of 0.081.
- Sub criteria on Caption, has a CR of 0.037.
- Sub criteria on Reels has a CR of 0.011.

The consistency ratio (CR) value for each Instagram sub criteria shows the results of $CR \leq 0.1$. So, it can be concluded that the importance comparison of Instagram sub criteria is stated to be consistent, so that the data processing can be continued to the next stage.

c. Determining Best Practices on Benchmark Partners

Determining best practices is carried out based on the observations results of Instagram performance for alternative benchmark partners. The benchmark partner observations are using checklist observations to assess the performance of Instagram benchmark partners on each Instagram criteria and sub criteria. In this research, the assessment is based on quantitative parameters that have been determined, also are obtained from previous research and relevant data. Assessment of observations will be carried out using a check mark (✓) to indicate the performance that has been done by benchmark partner and then given a weight based on a rating scale of 1 – 5, and each value has its own parameters according to the intended sub criteria. Furthermore, the observations results will be processed together with the results of AHP paired comparison questionnaire to calculate the priority ranking. The best practices are obtained from selected benchmark partners according to Instagram criteria. The results of benchmark partners are shown in Table 8.

Table 8 Result of Benchmark Partner

Criteria	Benchmark Partner	Total Weight	Ranking
Feed	THENBLANK	1.184	2
	CRSL	0.869	3
	Merche	1.264	1
Story	THENBLANK	1.074	2

	CRSL	1.238	1
	Merche	0.845	3
Profile	THENBLANK	1.003	1
	CRSL	0.675	3
	Merche	0.807	2
Caption	THENBLANK	0.492	1
	CRSL	0.397	2
	Merche	0.390	3
Reels	THENBLANK	0.763	1
	CRSL	0.469	3

Merche	0.642	2
--------	-------	---

Based on the table above, the ranking results for best practices from selected benchmark partners in accordance with the order of each ranking criteria respectively, as follows: 1) Merche; 2) CRSL; 3) THENBLANK; 4) THENBLANK; and 5) THENBLANK.

d. Integrated System Improvement Design

Criteria	Sub Criteria	Gap	Future Performance	Integrated System Design
Story	Doing endorsements with influencers.	Bling It On only does endorsements with influencers 3 – 4 times a month while CRSL does endorsements 5 – 6 times in a month.	Doing endorsements with influencers 5 - 6 times in a month.	1. Arrange SOP for endorsement
	Delivering up-to-date information.	Bling It On only uploads Story contents 4 – 6 times in a day while CRSL uploads 12 – 14 story contents per day.	Uploading Instagram Story for 12 – 14 contents every day with the latest contents.	2. Create a campaign timeline 3. Conduct consumer behavior research 4. Using a content calendar 5. Conduct Instagram insights and algorithm analysis
Feeds	Uploading various Feed contents.	Bling It On only uploads 3 variations of contents on Feed while Merche uploads 10 variations.	Uploading 10 types of contents variations on Instagram Feed	1. Using graphic editor software / applications to edit content
	Feed contents that pay attention to visual aesthetics.	Bling It On only implements 3 parameters to display aesthetic contents while Merche implements 5 parameters.	Implementing all the parameters (5 parameters) for aesthetics contents	2. Using Microsoft Excel or Google Calendar to create daily map contents
	Uploading contents at the right time (prime time).	Bling It On uploads contents in the range of 11.00 – 13.00 while Merche uploads contents in the range of 11.00 – 13.00 and 17.00 - 19.00.	Uploading contents in the range of 11.00 – 13.00 WIB and 17.00 – 19.00 WIB.	3. Using Instagram Scheduling Tool applications to upload Instagram automatically and on schedule
	Uploading Feed contents regularly.	Bling It On uploads contents 4 – 8 times in a month with different intensities while Merche uploads 14 – 16 times every month.	Uploading Feed contents 14 – 16 times per month.	4. Conduct market research 5. Conduct consumer behavior research
Profile	Providing additional reliable information.	Bling It On only uses 3 additional information features on Instagram Profile while THENBLANK uses 5 additional information.	Using all additional information features (5 features) on business account profiles	1. Determine real data information that can be trusted by the audience 2. Determine the brand tagline. 3. Create informative contents on highlights
Reels	Uploading interesting video contents.	Bling It On implements 4 features of video contents while THENBLANK implements 5 features.	Implementing all contents features (5 features) on Instagram Reels.	1. Using video editing software / applications
	Uploading various video contents.	Bling It On uploads 4 types of Reels content variations while THENBLANK uploads 6 types.	Uploading all types of contents variations (6 contents) on reels.	2. Using Microsoft Excel or Google Calendar to create daily map contents
	Uploading video contents regularly	Bling It On only uploads video Reels content 1 - 3 times every month while THENBLANK uploads 6 – 8 times every month.	Uploading video Reels content 6 – 8 times every month consistently.	3. Using Instagram Scheduling Tool applications to upload automatically and on schedule 4. Conduct market research for latest video trends
Caption	Delivering informative captions.	Bling It On only delivers 1 type of information on Caption while THENBLANK delivers 4 types of information.	Delivering 4 types of information on Instagram Caption.	1. Using Microsoft Excel or Miro to create caption templates
	Having an ideal writing structure.	Bling It On implements 1 type of ideal caption writing structure while THENBLANK implements 4 types of writing structure.	Implementing all the ideal writing structures on Caption (4 types), namely hooks, pain, solutions, and calls to action.	2. Using Hashtag Tracker to find popular hashtags on Instagram
	Using relevant hashtags on each upload.	Bling It On does not use hashtags in Instagram Caption while THENBLANK uses 3-4 hashtags.	Using 3 – 4 hashtags on Instagram Caption for each contents upload.	3. Understanding ethical guidelines for using language properly and correctly on social media

The integrated system design is carried out by determining future performance based on the gap identification with the aim of formulating a proposed improvement program for Bling It On' Instagram as a marketing communication tool. Determining future performance is also done through observation, analytical media, and advice from experts. Then after determining the future performance, identification of an integrated system

design is carried out to integrate human aspects with tools, method, and information. The result of integrated system improvement design can be seen in Table 9.

Table 9 Result of Benchmark Partner

V. CONCLUSION

This research was conduct to identify the priority ranking of criteria and sub criteria that needed to be considered in marketing communication through Instagram, identify the best practices from benchmark partners, and design integrated system of online marketing communication programs to improve Bling It On's Instagram. This study discusses five criteria (feed, story, profile, caption, reels) and 16 sub criteria that are obtained from integration between voice of customer and previous research, these criteria and sub criteria will be used as the success performance metrics to improve the use of Instagram. Benchmark partners were also obtained to be the best practice of Instagram's performance on each of the criteria, namely THENBLANK, CRSL, and Merche. The design of the improvement system for Instagram Bling It On is carried out on sub-criteria that have gaps with selected benchmark partners in each criterion. Thus, Bling It On can implement appropriate recommendations according to their abilities and needs.

REFERENCES

- [1] W. R. Susila and E. Munadi, "Penggunaan Analytical Hierarchy Process untuk Penyusunan Prioritas Proposal Penelitian," *Informatika Pertanian*, 2007.
- [2] C. A. Passos and R. B. Haddad, "Benchmarking: A tool for the improvement of production management," *IFAC Proceedings Volumes*, vol. 46, no. 24, pp. 577-581, 2013.
- [3] S. A. Fajrianisa and Yuliana, "Penilaian Tampilan Visual Feeds dan Postingan Instagram Hotel-Hotel Berbintang di Kota Padang sebagai Media Promosi Online," *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Keluarga*, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 284-291, 2019.
- [4] W. Buente, F. Dalisay, P. Pokhrel, H. K. Kramer and I. Pagano, "An Instagram-Based Study to Understand Betel Nut Use Culture in Micronesia: Exploratory Content Analysis," *Journal of Medical Internet Research*, vol. 22, no. 7, p. 1–13, 2020.
- [5] C. Valentini, S. Romenti, G. Murtarelli and M. Pizzetti, "Digital visual engagement: influencing purchase intentions on Instagram," *Journal of Communication Management*, vol. 22, no. 4, pp. 362-381, 2018.
- [6] A. P. Santoso, I. Baihaqi and S. F. Persada, "Pengaruh Konten Post Instagram terhadap Online Engagement: Studi Kasus pada Lima Merek Pakaian Wanita," *Jurnal Teknik ITS*, vol. 6, no. 1, pp. 217-221, 2017.
- [7] A. A. Fathoni, "Pengaruh Penggunaan Fitur Instagram Stories dan Interface Design Instagram terhadap Kepuasan Menggunakan Instagram pada Mahasiswa Fakultas Ilmu Komunikasi Universitas Gunadarma," *Mediakom: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 206-218, 2018.
- [8] M. Ichsan, D. H. M. Jumhur and I. S. Dharmoputra, "Pengaruh Consumer Online Rating and Review terhadap Minat Beli Konsumen Pada Marketplace Tokopedia di Wilayah Dki Jakarta," *e-Proceeding of Management*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 1828-1835, 2018.
- [9] F. Maulana, R. R. Pratama and A. Trihatmojo, "Pengaruh Penggunaan Fitur Instagram Stories terhadap Kepuasan Mendapatkan Informasi pada Fans Klub Sepakbola Liverpool (Big Reds) Jakarta," *eJournal Komunikasi*, vol. 12, no. 1, pp. 57-66, 2021.
- [10] M. Maulyda and D. Setyabudi, "Pengaruh Intensitas Menonton Story Promosi Endorsement Tokopedia di Instagram dan Tingkat Popularitas Endorser terhadap Minat Beli Konsumen di Tokopedia," *Undip E-Journal*, 2018.
- [11] S. Khan, "Instagram as a marketing tool for luxury brands," *International Journal of Management and Business Research*, vol. 8, no. 1, p. 120–126, 2018.
- [12] P. Alfonzo, *Mastering Mobile through Social Media: Creating Engaging Content on Instagram and Snapchat*, Chicago: ALA TechSource, 2019.
- [13] H. I. Hartini, H. F. AR and C. , "Kesantunan Berbahasa dalam Komentar Caption Instagram,"

Indonesian language and literature education Faculty of Teacher Training and Education Riau University, 2017.

- [14] Y. Oktavia, "Pengaruh Hashtag Engagement #Peopleweareoemahetnik di Media Sosial Instagram terhadap Brand Image Ukm Oemah Etnik," Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya, 2019.
- [15] I. Faramida, C. and H. , "Tindak Tutur Representatif pada Caption Instagram," *JURNAL TUAH: Pendidikan dan Pengajaran Bahasa*, vol. 1, no. 1, 2019.
- [16] N. P. T. Tran, "Instagram Content Marketing in Higher Education," Vaasa University of Applied Sciences (VAMK), Finlandia, 2020.
- [17] A. N. Fahrozi, "Analisis Kerja Praktik dan Manajemen Pemasaran pada Cak Ed Delivery Lamongan," Universitas Internasional Semen Indonesia, Gresik, 2021.
- [18] F. Mangindaan, D. P. E. Saerang and J. Tumiwa, "Preferensi Konsumen terhadap Kendaraan Off Road Kabin Ganda di Manado menggunakan Metode AHP (Studi Kasus: Toyota Hilux, Isuzu D-Max, dan Mitsubishi Strada Triton)," *Jurnal EMBA*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 2426-2436, 2017.